

Minutes of the Meeting of the Health and Wellbeing Overview and Scrutiny Committee held on 13 October 2015 at 7.00 pm

Present: Councillors Graham Snell (Chair), Steve Liddiard (Vice-Chair), Yash Gupta (MBE), James Halden, Charlie Key and Tunde Ojetola

Ian Evans, Thurrock Coalition Representative
Kim James, Healthwatch Thurrock Representative

In attendance: Councillor Barbara Rice, Cabinet Member for Adult Social Care & Health
Ruth Ashmore, NHS England
Jane Hubert, NHS England
Jessamy Kinghorn, NHS England Specialised Services (Midlands and East of England)
Dr Wai-Lup Wong, NHS England
Mandy Ansell, (Acting) Interim Accountable Officer, Thurrock NHS Clinical Commissioning Group
Dr Anand Deshpande, Chair of Thurrock NHS CCG Board
Roger Harris, Director of Adults, Health and Commissioning
Ian Wake, Director of Public Health
Harminster Dhillon, Statutory Complaints & Engagement Manager
Maria Payne, Health Needs Assessment Manager, Public Health
Jenny Shade, Senior Democratic Services Officer

Before the start of the Meeting, all present were advised that the meeting may be filmed and was being recorded, with the audio recording to be made available on the Council's website.

12. Minutes

The Minutes of the Health and Wellbeing Overview and Scrutiny Committee, held on 23 July 2015, were approved as a correct record.

Councillor Halden requested confirmation that the Estate Strategy referred to in the Primary Care section of the minutes would be ready for the borough and not just Tilbury. The Officers confirmed that this was the case.

13. Urgent Items

An item of urgent business was raised by NHS England regarding the change of contract in the Positron Emission Tomography – Computed Tomography (PET-CT) service and how services in South Essex have been identified to benefit from the increased capacity and improved facilities.

The Chair introduced Dr Wong, Ruth Ashmore, Jane Hubert and Jess Kinghorn from NHS England and thanked them for attending the committee.

At 7.27 pm Councillor Gupta arrived at the meeting.

Ruth Ashmore and Jane Hubert from NHS England explained the procurement and recommendations resulting from an exercise undertaken by NHS England in February 2015 where a new provider was awarded a 10 year national contract for the provision of a PET-CT scanning. As part of the contract the PET-CT services in South Essex had been identified to benefit from the increased investment to install new scanners and improve the current infrastructure and increase the access to the services available.

There were two options that emerged from this consultation; one is to site the unit at Basildon and Thurrock University Hospitals or site the unit at Southend University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust (SUH).

Currently a unit is sited at Basildon and Thurrock University Hospital as a mobile unit operating for two days a week. The recommendation is that this unit be moved to Southend University Hospital as a fixed facility which will function five days per week.

Dr Wong, Consultant Radiologist, gave a background to his career. Dr Wong main point was to ensure that service is excellent for the residents of South Essex. Over the next five years there will be an increased use of PET-CT service and stated that siting of the PET-CT scanner should be at Southend so that it can work alongside the radiotherapy services.

Mandy Ansell from CCG was only aware of this item having recently read an article about the proposed change and invited Dr Deshpande and Dr Raja to comment on the report.

Dr Deshpande stated that journey times and the logistics of cancer patients attending appointments should be the most important element of this consultation but the report does not cover this. Patients should not be expected to travel to different hospitals for services which were already in place and working well.

The Chair asked Dr Raja, a GP from a doctor's surgery in Horndon on the Hill to speak. Dr Raja commented that only 20% of patients live in Southend on Sea and the remaining 80% live in different locations and that some areas such as Harlow were not even part of the consultation process. Dr Raja went on to explain that the current service had been functioning for eight years and was a fantastic service there were no logical reasons to move the service to Southend. At the moment the greatest use of this scanner is for lung cancer patients. All images were already being scanned and sent to Southend with no problem, scans can be sent anywhere in the world and do not need to be in the same building as the radiotherapy services.

Ian Wake concurred with the comments made by Dr Deshpande and Dr Raja and stated that he had concerns on the accuracy of some of the facts within the paper. Ian referred the members to the population access and patient experience section of the report and stated that patient breakdown and that the explanation of the equal number of patients were not accurate and that logistics of the service should be a major consideration.

Ian Wake also commented that the biggest issue with Thurrock patients is the fragmentation of pathways across different hospital sites. Appointments not being held at the same hospital were causing the system to break down.

Kim James from HealthWatch commented that unless CCG had notified HealthWatch they would not have been aware of this item. Kim James also commented that on the engagement of patients and patient's groups within the recommendation 30 day period of consultation would not be feasible in this short time and that only one group from Thurrock had been contacted and that the voice of all should be heard.

Councillor Ojetola commented with the interest of both sides of the experts in the room his main concern was on behalf of residents of Thurrock. Councillor Ojetola's concern was that this was the first time he had heard about the report and had concerns with the consultation plan.

Councillor Halden had concerns that if Dr Deshpande, Mandy Ansell and Ian Wake had no confidence in the report and that the proposed change in service would not improve cancer patient pathways he would support the Chair's recommendation to refuse.

Councillor Key echoed Councillor Ojetola and Councillor Halden's comments and agreed that cancer patients need as little stress as possible when attending hospital appointments and pathways were dictated by hospitals, therefore having to go to two different hospitals for separate services would not work.

The Chair invited a member of the audience to speak. Dr Qaiser Malik, Lead Clinician and Consultant Radiologist at Basildon were asked to join the table and gave a background to his career. Dr Malik confirmed that the PET-CT scanner had been at Basildon Hospital for eight years operating twice a week. Recently this has increased to three to four days per week.

Dr Malik stated that a static building to house the PET-CT could be available within three months with its own entrance into the main department building. Consideration of patients should be a first priority and limit travel times between appointments and it made sense to leave the service in Basildon.

Councillor Key thanked Dr Malik and asked for clarification on how long do patients currently have to wait for a PET-CT and was the service meeting the demand. Dr Malik stated that the waiting time for a PET-CT scan at Basildon was two weeks and demand was being met. Councillor Key then asked why we were proposing this change when we were already meeting demands.

Councillor Barbara Rice made an observation that it was disrespectful of NHS England to submit such late papers to members of HOSC and then expect members to make such a decision on the recommendation was unfair to Thurrock.

Ruth Ashmore thanked the committee for the comments made and apologised for the lateness of the report. Ruth explained that the first step was to explain to the committee the timings and secondly to engage with the community and then report back to Thurrock HOSC to brief Members.

The Chair concluded that the report was a recommendation to move the PET-CT scan to Southend and that NHS England have attended the Thurrock HOSC to seek approval. It is the decision of the Thurrock HOSC not to accept this proposal and recommend that this is refused. The reasons for this being refused is due to the short notice of the report, the statistics in the report being incorrect and not substantial enough with no evidence of there being any improved service to Thurrock Residents by moving the PET-CT service from Basildon to Southend.

It was agreed as a cross-party decision of members to refuse this recommendation.

The Chair thanked Dr Wong, Ruth Ashmore, Jane Hubert and Jess Kinghorn for attending.

RESOLVED:

- 1. That the recommendation to move the location of the PET-CT Service from Basildon to Southend be refused.**

Mandy Ansell, Dr Deshpande, Dr Wong, Ruth Ashmore, Jane Hubert and Jess Kinghorn left the committee at 20.05.

14. Declarations of Interests

There were no declarations of interest.

15. Items Raised by HealthWatch

Kim James, the HealthWatch co-opted member, provided the committee with an update on Coach House, a health funded nursing home in Thurrock where the providers, Family Mosaic, have served notice to the CCG.

Discussions between Family Mosaic and CCG were still on going after a meeting was undertaken between CCG, Family Mosaic, Councillor Kent and Councillor Barbara Rice and chaired by Roger Harris, Director of Adults, Health and Commissioning.

A decision made at this meeting was that Family Mosaic will try and source another possible new provider and look at any change of monies requested. The assessments undertaken have identified three residents who could not be found alternative, suitable placements locally and so would need to be placed some way outside of the borough ie. Nottinghamshire for one of the residents.

The next meeting has been scheduled for 28 October 2015 where discussions will continue.

Councillor Gupta thanked HealthWatch for all their hard work in relation to Coach House.

RESOLVED:

- 1. That an update on Coach House be included on the work programme for December 2015.**

Councillor Halden left the committee at 20.10.

16. 2014/15 Annual Complaints and Representations Report

Roger Harris, Director of Adults, introduced Harminder Dhillon, Statutory Complaints and Engagement Manager for Thurrock as the Officer presenting this report to Members.

The Officer introduced the report which provided the members with an update on the operation of the Adult Social Care Complaints Procedure. The report covered the period 1 April 2014 to 31 March 2015. The Officer stated that it was a statutory requirement to produce an annual complaints report on adult social care complaints.

The adult social care complaints procedure is operated in accordance with the Local Authority Social Services and National Health Service Complaints (England) Regulations 2009.

The Chair thanked the Officer and stated the report was good and very thorough. The Chair asked that if domiciliary care was the main reason for the complaints. The Officer stated that this was not the case but stated there were changes within domiciliary care, especially the costs and the recruitment of carers.

Councillor Ojetola thanked the Officer for the good quality of the report but was concerned that the Complaint Outcome figures and the Ombudsman Enquiry given at the Standards and Audit Committee were different to those in the report presented tonight.

Roger Harris explained that it was probably an element of timing as to when the reports were prepared. The Officer works closely with the Corporate Complaints team and will coordinate with them and prepare an up to date Complaint Outcomes figures.

Councillor Ojetola asked why there was a push for 20 days. The Officer confirmed that the target had been set at 20 working days to resolve a complaint, to ensure that each complaint was looked at thoroughly and not rushed. Although complaints may not always be resolved within that time, it was normal for complaints to be dealt within 10 working days.

The Chair agreed that all statistics should be uniform to ensure better reading and understanding by the public and councillors. There should be a cut off time to ensure consistency for all data reports.

Councillor Gupta stated that it was encouraging to see the number of compliments. Councillor Gupta asked the Officer who makes the decision that the complaint is a complaint and not a concern. The Officer confirmed that there is no separate procedure for complaints or concerns. Concerns were resolved on the spot, if it cannot it will be classed as a complaint.

Roger Harris was asked about "Looking Forward" and confirmed that it was very hard to predict but an area of most concern was domiciliary care.

Harminder Dhillon stated that all providers have their own complaints procedure and they cannot force people to complain.

RESOLVED:

- 1. That the contents of the report to consider and comment on the annual complaints report for 2014/15 were noted.**
- 2. That the number of compliments received is noted.**
- 3. That the most up to date Complaint Outcomes figures will be issued to all members.**

Harminder Dhillon left the committee at 20.30.

17. Consultation on proposed changes to the way Social Care is provided in Thurrock

The Director of Adults, Health and Commissioning presented the report that provided further details on the proposed changes to the way social care is provided in Thurrock. The report outlined the arrangements for consulting on the proposals through a range of channels.

The council launched a consultation on these proposals to make savings in the Adult Social Care budget for the next financial year. The consultation went live on the consultation portal on Monday 14 September asking for the views of local people and service users about the proposals. With two months left on the consultation process, there have already been 109 comments received.

A further report on the consultation and the responses received, together with recommendations for any changes to the provision of social care, will be made in early 2016. It is likely that, subject to the views of the Committee and the decision of Cabinet, any changes could be introduced from April 2016.

It was agreed by all councillors that the report and consultation were very thorough and that the views of Thurrock residents were important.

RESOLVED:

- 1. That the Committee note the arrangements for the consultation.**
- 2. That the item on the consultation on proposed changes to the way Social Care is provided in Thurrock be added to the work programme for January 2016.**

18. Meals on Wheels Update

Roger Harris, Director of Adults, Health and Commissioning, presented the report which stated that a decision to further extend the contract with the current provider Royal Voluntary Service (RVS) until April 2017. This will allow time to develop the market and also explore working more closely with the local community and voluntary sector to grow a wider range of providers. This will be done at the same time as the review of the Domiciliary Care contract. The Officer confirmed that all service users that have the meals on wheels service will receive a re-assessment.

The current provider has agreed in principle to a further year's extension until the end of March 2017. However, this rests on a review and agreement of the current unit price to take into account the introduction of the National Living Wage which comes into force April 2016.

Councillor Liddiard asked if schools in the local community could assist with providing hot meals. The Officer confirmed that it was Havering who were approached but could no longer commit to this arrangement.

Councillor Ojetola thanked the Officer for the well-presented report and agreed that it should not be just a microwave meal option where social contact is lost with residents. Councillor Ojetola further explained the charities in Chafford Hundred who provide lunch time meals for children when not at school and it is those types of charities that could help to support those requiring the hot meal service in the future.

Councillor Ojetola asked for clarification between the Recommendations and the Options of the report. The Officer confirmed that the Recommendation is what is being proposed now and the Option is if the hot meal service were to stop.

Councillor Key stated that the numbers were likely to drop in the future and although thorough discussions have already taken place he agrees that having the options open is a good thing.

The Officer stated that with 39,000 meals delivered last year there is no guarantee that numbers will decrease and that the price of meals will probably increase. All Members agreed that options should be kept open to give Officers the time to engage with charities and local communities.

RESOLVED:

- 1. That the committee support the extension of the contract with RVS for a further year.**
- 2. That the future of the service will be considered as part of the wider review of domiciliary care.**

19. Annual Public Health Report 2014

Ian Wake, Director of Public Health, presented the report which focused on the Thurrock Annual Public Health Report key issue "Health and Wellbeing of Older People". This report was prepared by his predecessor Andrea Atherton.

It was confirmed that the numbers of older people in Thurrock were set to increase substantially over the next 20 years, with the greatest increase in those aged 85 years and over. There were significant implications for health and social care services associated with managing issues arising from an ageing population.

Ian Wake stated that to ensure the wellbeing of the growing number of older people there needed to be greater focus on health promotion and disease prevention in older age. The evidence suggested that making healthy lifestyle choices and behaviour at the age of 40-60 year can have an impact on health in later years.

The Annual Public Health Report, Summary of Recommendation, had 24 recommendations listed and had received positive feedback.

The Chair stated that the report was well presented and contained mostly good news as most of the recommendations were already taken place in Thurrock. The Chair praised the Officers and the Portfolio Holder for improving the health of residents in the borough.

Councillor Ojetola asked that in the next report could performance indicators be shown against each recommendation. This will help local residents understand the report fully.

Ian Wake confirmed that 75% of the progress report was complete with performance indicators. Once this was completed Ian would issue to all Members.

Councillor Barbara Rice thanked Ian Wake for his pro-active approach and how refreshing it was to have him on board at Thurrock.

Councillor Barbara Rice stated that as a fact many older residents were seeing themselves as a burden to others and that more thought should be used when using the word burden.

Ian Wake confirmed working with the community is the right road ahead and without carers the system would fall over.

Councillor Ojetola asked for clarification on what the University of Third Age was. Kim James confirmed that this was a large older person group, who undertake a good source of activities and meet regularly at Blackshots.

RESOLVED:

- 1. That the contents and recommendations of the 2014 Annual Public Health Report be noted.**
- 2. That the Officer will note performance indicators against all recommendations in future reports.**

20. Regeneration, Air Quality and Health

Ian Wake introduced Maria Payne, Health Needs Assessment Manager, Public Health, to represent the report to Members which provided an update to the report previously presented to this committee on 17 February 2015 which summarised the evidence regarding health impacts of air pollution. This report provided an update to members on the subsequent actions taken by Thurrock Council, including the commissioning of an integrated Air Quality Strategy for the borough and appointed SmallFish Strategy Consultants who were in the process of producing the Issues and Options Report.

The Officer confirmed that an Officers' Working Group had now been established with officers from:

- Planning
- Public Health
- Transport
- Environment

A discussion took place on how the air quality can impact on Thurrock residents' health with the increased traffic to the borough.

The Chair and Members agreed that the report was well present and that work is in progress.

Councillor Liddiard left the committee at 21.10.

Councillor Ojetola asked the Officer what the member's involvement would be. The Officer confirmed that further discussions would need to take place with the Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee, the Health and Wellbeing Board, Directors and Cabinet.

The Chair stated that this was a good case to be put to Government that Thurrock should be included in the low emission zone that is currently a traffic pollution scheme used in London. All Members and Officers agreed.

RESOLVED:

1. **That the progress made from the previous report in developing an integrated approach to improving air quality to mitigate health risks was noted.**
2. **That the Air Quality Officers' Working Group presents the completed Air Quality Strategy to a future meeting in 2016, together with a proposed action plan was noted.**
3. **That the item Regeneration, Air Quality and Health be added to the work programme for February 2016.**

21. Work Programme 2015/16

The Chair and Members agreed that the following items be added to the work programme:

- That an update on Coach House is provided from HealthWatch be included on the work programme for December 2015.
- That an update on the consultation on proposed changes to the way Social Care is provided in Thurrock be included on the work programme for January 2016.
- That an update on Regeneration, Air Quality and Health be included on the work programme for February 2016.

Members were in agreement with the proposed changes to the work programme, following which the Chair requested that an updated work programme be circulated to the Committee and Officers following the meeting.

RESOLVED:

1. **That the work programme be noted subject to the amendments details above.**

The meeting finished at 9.13 pm

Approved as a true and correct record

CHAIR

DATE

**Any queries regarding these Minutes, please contact
Democratic Services at Direct.Democracy@thurrock.gov.uk**